

## FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT

### Institutional Quality Assurance Program (IQAP) Review

#### Music and Music Cognition

##### **Date of Review: March 22 - 24, 2021**

*In accordance with the University Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP), this final assessment report provides a synthesis of the external evaluation and the internal response and assessments of the undergraduate Music programs delivered by the **School of the Arts**. This report identifies the significant strengths of the programs, together with opportunities for program improvement and enhancement, and it sets out and prioritizes the recommendations that have been selected for implementation.*

*The report includes an Implementation Plan that identifies who will be responsible for approving the recommendations set out in the Final Assessment Report; who will be responsible for providing any resources entailed by those recommendations; any changes in organization, policy or governance that will be necessary to meet the recommendations and who will be responsible for acting on those recommendations; and timelines for acting on and monitoring the implementation of those recommendations.*

##### **Executive Summary of the Review**

The School of the Arts submitted a self-study in January 2020 to the Vice-Provost, Faculty to initiate the cyclical program review of its undergraduate music programs. The approved self-study presented program descriptions, learning outcomes, and analyses of data provided by the Office of Institutional Research and Analysis. Appendices to the self-study contained all course outlines associated with the program and the CVs for each member in the program.

Two arm's length external reviewers, one from Manitoba and one from Saskatchewan and one internal reviewer were endorsed by the Dean, Faculty of Humanities, and selected by the Vice-Provost. The review team reviewed the self-study and supporting documentation and then conducted a virtual site visit on February 1 - 3 2021. The visit included meetings with the Provost, Vice-Provosts, Dean, Associate Dean and faculty and students and members of the pertinent administrative units.

The Director of the School of the Arts and the Dean of the Faculty of Humanities submitted responses to the Reviewers' Report (June 2021). Specific recommendations were discussed and clarifications and corrections were presented. Follow-up actions and timelines were included.

##### **Strengths**

In their report (April 2021), the Review team recognized the faculty's strengths in research and teaching and the interdisciplinary potential for new programs with STEM faculties.

The reviewers highlighted the following strengths of the programs:

Reviewers commented on the high quality performance spaces, the opportunities for STEM collaborations, and faculty research as strengths.

**Summary of the Reviewers’ Recommendations with the Department’s and Dean’s Responses**

Recommendation	Proposed Follow-Up	Responsibility for Leading Follow-Up	Timeline for Addressing Recommendation
2. Implement the proposed STEM/Music B.Mus. degree ASAP	This is currently proceeding. Music, Science and Health Science were awarded a SAF to provide support for preparing the IQAP proposal.	Matthew Woolhouse is leading this proposal.	Proposal is due for Dean’s approval October 2021
3. Appoint a minimum of 2 full time tenure track faculty music positions in: (A) Instrumental Conducting / Music Education and (B) Choral Conducting / Music Education.	Faculty feel strongly that faculty complemented be taken very seriously.	Dean of Humanities and Director of the School of the Arts	
3a. Develop on campus special event music activities such as annual honour concert band, jazz band, and choir weekend projects.	The music programs existing ensembles and choirs are quite active on campus (outside of the Pandemic). More could be done to promote to highschool students and alumni.	Led by ensemble and choir directors.	ongoing
3b. Work in consultation with local school-based music educators to develop and increase the musical abilities of local and regional high school music ensembles and make	Such collaborations are already in place in music, primarily led by the CLA and adjunct sessional faculty member. This work could be better cemented with full time faculty dedicated	Tracy Wong	ongoing

critical social and professional connections with McMaster University.	to these collaborations. More publicity and communication of these projects could also be mobilized on the website and through social media.		
3c. Adjudicating at local, regional and national music festivals	Some faculty have been doing this in the past (Golden Horseshoe festival) and faculty recognized they could do more as a recruitment strategy.	All faculty	ongoing
3d. Develop appropriate publicity and communication avenues between all regional pre university music teachers and individual applied teachers in your community and beyond as well	Music faculty are mobilizing a social media campaign spring 2021 based on data collected during auditions that demonstrates many students learn about the program via social media.	Andrew Mitchell and Tracy Wong	May 2021
3e. Develop regional pre university band, jazz and choir festivals <i>on campus</i>	Faculty felt that this would be difficult to manage and preferred to focus on collaborations with high schools at this point, as it is work that has already started and has proven successful.	n/a	
3f. Champion various interdisciplinary and intra-disciplinary ensemble-based performance projects with on campus STEM partners.	We assume this will emerge out of the STEM music program that is being developed.	Matthew Woolhouse	Future (once or as new degree is being rolled out).
3g. Champion various Canadian social justice issues and initiatives on	There have been discussions about an Indigenous music and	Matthew Woolhouse	Academic year 2021-2022

McMaster's campus. One of many examples to articulate this point is the UofS Jazz Ensemble's Truth and Reconciliation 500 Years Indigenous-focused concert.	dance course, with Rheanne Chartrand from the Museum. With a new Indigenous Studies director in place such conversations will resume. It is crucial that such projects be Indigenous-led.		
3h. Serve as B.Mus. student faculty advisors for McMaster B.Mus. students who wish to go on to pursue a career in school-based Music Education.	Currently faculty members do consult with students about required courses and career options. Faculty will use social media and other communication strategies to get this messaging out to students.	Andrew Mitchell	Academic year 2021-2022
3i. Start a McMaster alumni (not just B.Mus. alumni) band, jazz band and choir 'homecoming' projects and/or ongoing alumni projects	There is an existing alumni choir and they are in touch with Tracy Wong and are collaborating together.	Tracy Wong	ongoing
3j. Develop virtual concert videos	During the past year of the pandemic ensembles and choirs have been recorded and showcased on youtube. Faculty will continue to do this once they return to campus.	Ensemble and choir directors.	ongoing
3k. Develop music-area specific bi-annual e-newsletters (e.g. UofS Dept of Music newsletter	The launch of the music Instagram account fall 2020 will continue to be used to promote music events, open houses, concerts and other activities.	Tracy to lead	
3l. Develop in-person and/or virtual	Open houses are led by the faculty of	SOTA director and music faculty	ongoing

McMaster University B.Mus.-specific Open House events and/or weekends	humanities and each area from within SOTA participates annually including music. Music specific open houses (there were 3 in fall 2020) on zoom will continue to be developed. The virtual format allows students, teachers and counsellors to attend.		
4. Appoint a 3 <sup>rd</sup> full time tenure track music faculty position in the area(s) of jazz and/or contemporary/world music	See point 3 above. Crucial is balancing all priorities in music; TT should be able to contribute broadly to the full program.	SOTA director and Dean of Humanities	
5a. Develop 2-year course rotations model for all music techniques courses (e.g. Brass, Percussion, Woodwind) and selected upper year music electives and then publicly publish (which includes committing to) these course rotational models so that your current B.Mus. and non-B.Mus. majors alike can plan their courses for the next 2 years accordingly.	Faculty felt this was a good idea and will be meeting in May 2021 to draft a rotational schedule.	Matthew and Andrew to lead.	May 2021 (deadline by Curriculum time fall 2021)
5b. Encourage students performing violin, viola, cello, bass, flute, trumpet, clarinet to buy or rent their own instruments from a local retailer while maintaining McMaster's	Faculty felt this is also a good idea but want to caution not removing accessibility issues to students who don't have access to instruments.	SOTA director and Manager of Operations	Academic year 2021-2022

compliment or rarer and/or specialized instruments (i.e., bass flute, oboe, bassoon, all percussion, bass trombone, tuba, etc.).			
6. Appoint a <i>music</i> faculty member ( <i>not support staff from SOTA</i> ) to have governance over hiring and pedagogical management of all hourly music instructors.	While the staffing of the hourly instructors is lead by SOTA admin team, music faculty will develop a kind of “code of conduct” and equity training for instructors.	Andrew take the lead and then work with SOTA director.	For summer 2021
7. Allow for and facilitate on-campus instrument-specific (including voice) master classes, given by applied teachers (hourly and where appropriate full time) and make these evening and weekend master classes open to the general public (living or virtual).	This year a donor provided funds for a series of master classes for the ensembles. If funding continues faculty felt they were highly successful and could be opened up to the public as well.	Music faculty	ongoing
8. Consider developing a for profit pre university conservatory of music area that would be active on weekends, evenings and the summer	Faculty felt if donor funds could be realized a summer camp would be a great idea.	Tracy lead	Summer 2022
9. Create incentive structures for all programs within SOTA to benefit through <i>rewarding</i> the creation of unique and attractive innovative service and core course programming. Do this by awarding a portion	Faculty would like a sense of if they have large numbers in service courses how that is reflected in allowing/enabling some of the smaller upper year courses.	SOTA director	ongoing

of all service teaching back to the program said teaching ultimately comes from			
10. Appoint a clear administrative & governance music leader, a person with music-specific experience, to coordinate all things B.Mus.-related on a daily operations and general long term planning basis.	Faculty recommended appointing a music faculty as assistant director who would have a vote at DAC and assist the director with overseeing the music program.		

**Dean’s Response, Faculty of Humanities:**

**Faculty complement:** It is the case that the reviewers recommend 2-3 TT hires over the short term to support the B. Mus program. This is quite common in IQAP reviews. The Faculty, unfortunately, is not currently growing its faculty complement, nor is it, I’m afraid, keeping up with retirements and departures. That reality aside, the current faculty cohort is able to cover the program’s needs, and the program review seemed to indicate that new TT faculty were needed primarily to run outreach efforts. As the program response indicates, the Music faculty already engage in a fair amount of outreach. More could be done, for sure, but we will need to think of other ways to strengthen existing outreach and introduce new efforts than new TT lines at the present time.

**Declining enrollments:** as noted above, I agree we may wish to think about whether we are maximizing our outreach and recruitment efforts. We have only recently hired a full-time recruitment officer in the Faculty and Communications Manager. We can certainly leverage their expertise, along with the efforts already underway in Music to get the word out more. I’m glad to hear the Music faculty discussed the launch of a social media campaign this spring, and I was very impressed by Joe Resendes’ virtual concert that brought high school musicians together with the McMaster Concert Band. The new SOTA director has lots of good ideas and experience when it comes to engaging with schools and community groups. I am sure she will work with the Music faculty on some new recruitment initiatives that reflect their interests.

All that said, I felt the external reviewers downplayed the significance of the new SAF-funded B.Sc/B. Mus and B. HSc/B. Mus degree combinations that we are currently working on in the Faculty, under the leadership of Prof. Matthew Woolhouse. We are hopeful that these new combined honours offerings will be of interest to some of the same students who participate in our ensembles but currently major only in STEM and Health disciplines. I want to thank Dr. Woolhouse for his work on this cross-Faculty initiative and look forward to

seeing the outcomes. Promotion of this new option will be important when the time comes. An international certificate in music cognition currently under discussion, offering international experience to students, might further bolster the profile of the program and strengthen recruitment.

In tandem with these efforts to rework the B. Mus degree to make way for combined options with STEM program students, I recommend that Music faculty also work with Associate Dean to think of additional ways to open the stand-alone B. Mus program to afford greater access to more students and further interactions with other programs in the Humanities

**Additional recommendations and comments:**

- I was happy to see the reviewers recommend that we can cut back on the number of instruments that we purchase, maintain and store for student use. I recognize that some of the less common instruments should still be provided for by the Music program.
- I support the course rotation idea if it would benefit students, though the assistant dean should be consulted, to make sure the plan does not inadvertently create inflexibilities. While a rotation should support student planning, we will need to make clear that alterations are sometimes unavoidable.
- I support greater engagement around social justice causes. What I would recommend, however, is that the Music faculty and SOTA director think about how Music can work with other SOTA and/or Humanities faculty on such projects. There is no need to duplicate efforts, and the impact will be greater by combining ideas and energy.
- Relatedly, I did not see any reference to other forms of collaboration within SOTA and only one reference to Music-related faculty researchers outside of SOTA in either the external review report or the program response. I recognize that the focus of the review is on
- The B. Mus alone, but one way of strengthening the B. Mus is to leverage relationships with others. I applaud the B. Mus/STEM proposals for this reason. I would therefore also recommend that the 3 permanent faculty and SOTA Director work on deepening relationships within SOTA and between Music faculty and other music-adjacent faculty in Humanities and other Faculties (music cognition), to maximize outreach, recruitment, research and teaching activities.
- One item that I did not see reference to in the program's response was the reviewers' recommendation that ensemble members in other programs be charged a participation fee. There is a substantial cost to the Faculty to run the ensembles, and other Faculties regularly charge fees for learning and co-curricular experiences with success. Clearly other Music programs do it for ensembles, according to the external reviewers.
- **Finances:** Associate Dean Corner, in particular, has worked hard over the last two years to communicate with the Music faculty about the Faculty's budget and how it works. This communication has aided the development of the new B. Mus/STEM proposals, for example. We will continue to educate all members of the Faculty about the financial situation. As part of this effort, the annual costing exercise begun



under the previous dean is expected to resume after a hiatus owing to staff leaves and the pandemic.

- **Governance:** there is no voting at DAC, it is an advisory council. I have full confidence that the Director of the School can adequately represent the needs of all faculty members in her unit. She should, of course, maintain open communication within the School to facilitate her representation of all interests and needs of its members.

#### **Quality Assurance Committee Recommendation:**

McMaster's Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) reviewed the above documentation and the committee recommends that the program should follow the regular course of action with a progress report and subsequent full external cyclical review to be conducted no later than 8 years after the start of the last review.